Audit report on compliance with licensing assessment criteria
Date: 9-10 January 2025

Barts Health NHS Trust

HTA licensing number 40052

Licensed under the Human Tissue Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation Regulations 2012 (as amended).

Licensed activities – Procurement

Organ type	Kidney
Adult (living donor)	**DC, OC, P, T, R**

Procurement Activities: donor characterisation (DC), organ characterisation (OC), preservation of an organ (P), making arrangements to transport an organ (T), retrieval of an organ (R)

Licensed activities – Transplant

Organ type	Kidney
Adult recipient	**OC, P, T, I**

Transplantation Activities: organ characterisation (OC), preservation of an organ (P), making arrangements to transport an organ (T), implantation of an organ (I)

Summary of audit findings

Barts Health NHS Trust (the establishment) was found to have met all HTA assessment criteria that were assessed as part of the audit.

The HTA has assessed the establishment as suitable to be licensed for the activities specified.

Compliance with HTA assessment criteria

All applicable HTA assessment criteria that were assessed as part of the audit have been assessed as fully met.

Advice

The HTA advises the establishment to consider the following to further improve practice:

Number	Assessment Criterion	Advice
1.	CT2, CT3 & CT4	During a review of living donor kidney records, an example was found where a potential living donor had been referred to the establishment. Initial medical and social history forms used by the referring centre had been used to record donor history however, not all of the relevant questions had been included. . Staff explained that the form is reviewed at the establishment by the living donor coordinator, who will ask further questions when meeting the potential donor face to face to ensure that all relevant questions have been covered. The establishment is advised to include a note within the potential living donor's record that these additional questions have been posed to the donor and to record the responses.
2.	P2	The establishment has two hypothermic perfusion devices which can be used to perfuse kidneys. The establishment is advised to identify each device individually so that when one is used for perfusion, a record of which device has been used for a specific kidney can be maintained.
3.	P3	A separate store of perfusion fluid for use in the perfusion devices is kept adjacent to the devices in theatres. The establishment is advised to add a temperature monitoring device to this separate

Number	Assessment Criterion	Advice
		store so that the storage temperature for the perfusion fluid can be monitored and recorded in a similar way to the main fluid stock held at the establishment.
4.	TC1	While reviewing HTA-A and HTA-B forms, some examples were found where the HTA-A form number had not been added to the HTA-B form. The establishment is advised to remind staff that when completing HTA-B forms, the HTA-A form number should be added for completeness.
5.	TC1	An example was seen during the review of transplant records where an HTA-B form had been completed via the electronic portal however, the final acknowledgement and instruction to submit the electronic document had not been completed. The establishment is advised to remind staff completing HTA-B forms that all fields must be completed and the form submitted once completed.
6.	General	The establishment uses downloaded National Operating Procedures (NOPs) for procedural documentation. These operating procedures are supplemented by a number of in-house guides, for example prompts on checklists or guidance on how to receipt and dispatch cross match material. The establishment is advised to create a consolidated collection of NOPs and the relevant associated supplementary guidance so that there is a single point of reference that can be shared with new staff or staff wishing to review procedures.

Background

The establishment undertakes kidney transplants involving living and deceased donors.

The establishment has been licensed by the HTA since August 2012. This was the establishment's fourth audit; the most recent previous

audit took place in October and November 2022.

Since the audit in 2022, there have been no significant changes to the licence arrangements, or the activities carried out under the licence.

Description of audit activities undertaken

Criteria assessed against during the audit
Of the 30 assessment criteria, 28 of these were assessed during the audit. Assessment criteria CT1 was not assessed as the establishment is not responsible for characterisation of deceased donors. Assessment criteria GN3 was also not assessed on this occasion.

Review of governance documentation
The audit team reviewed UKAS and EFI certification (as applicable) of laboratories undertaking donor and organ characterisation including those of the histocompatibility and immunology, haematology, histopathology, biochemistry and microbiology laboratories. In addition, sterile services accreditation, medical devices policy and the Trust's record retention policy were also reviewed. In addition, two incidents reported via the establishment's internal incident system were reviewed including the investigation and outcomes.

Visual inspection
The pathways following how organs are received at the establishment were reviewed, and included the area where kidneys are stored prior to being transferred to theatres for transplant. This area is also where cross match material is stored temporarily before being sent to the laboratory. The audit team visited theatres used for transplant activity and the areas where perfusion fluids are stored. Discussions were held with establishment staff regarding the paperwork used to track organs through the pathway, fridge temperature monitoring systems and the types of perfusion fluids used. In addition, the area where mechanical perfusion devices and associated perfusion fluids were stored was also reviewed.

Audit of records
Five sets of clinical notes and associated transplant activity were reviewed including: one non-directed altruistic and two directed living kidney donor transplants and two deceased donor transplants.

Records for living donors included those relating to: clinic records and prospective donor medical health questionnaire, donor consent records, nephrologist and surgeon reviews of potential living donors, donor serological testing results, multi-disciplinary meeting records, cross match results, HTA living donor approval, donor operation note, the HTA-A and HTA-B forms (where applicable), and final clerking of the donor.

Records for deceased donor transplants included those relating to: transplant coordinator notes, recipient consent records, donor details recorded onto Transplant Path or the electronic offering system (EOS), donor serological testing results, hard copy of donor blood group, recipient blood group, crossmatch data, recipient operation note, and HTA-A and HTA-B forms including details of perfusion fluids used.

Report sent for factual accuracy: 7 February 2024

Report returned with comments: 21 February 2025

Final report issued: 28 February 2025

Appendix 1: The HTA's regulatory requirements

The HTA shall ensure that licence holders are audited for the purposes of ensuring compliance with the licensing conditions in schedule 1 of The Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation Regulations 2012 (as amended) and any requirements imposed by directions made under these Regulations.

The assessment criteria reflect the requirements of the statutory conditions outlined in schedule 1 and the HTA's directions. They are designed to promote the safe use of human organs and ensure traceability is maintained between donor and recipient. The HTA audits establishments it licences against eight groups of assessment criteria:

- Donor characterisation and organ characterisation
- Retrieval of organs for transplantation
- Organ preservation
- Making arrangements to transport an organ
- Implantation
- Traceability
- Serious adverse events and serious adverse reactions
- General (apply to all licences)

Reports of HTA audits are published on the HTA's website.

Throughout the audit process, the HTA assesses the establishment against the assessment criteria. Where the HTA determines that an assessment criteria is not met, the level of the shortfall is classified as 'Critical', 'Major' or 'Minor' (see Appendix 2: Classification of the level of shortfall). Where HTA assessment criteria are fully met, but the HTA has identified an area of practice that could be further improved, advice is provided in this report.

Appendix 2: Classification of the level of shortfall

Where the HTA determines that an assessment criterion is not met, the improvements required will be stated and the level of the shortfall will be classified as ‘Critical’, ‘Major’ or ‘Minor’. Where the HTA is not presented with evidence that an establishment meets the requirements of an assessment criterion, it works on the premise that a lack of evidence indicates a shortfall.

The action an establishment will be required to make following the identification of a shortfall is based on the HTA's assessment of the risk of harm and/or a breach of the HT Act or associated Directions.

1. Critical shortfall:

A shortfall which poses a significant direct risk of causing harm to the quality of an organ intended for transplantation or which poses a significant direct risk of causing harm to a donor or recipient.

or

A number of ‘major’ shortfalls, none of which is critical on its own, but viewed cumulatively represent a systemic failure and therefore are considered ‘critical’.

A critical shortfall may result in one or more of the following:

(1) A notice of proposal being issued to revoke the licence

(2) Some or all of the licensable activity at the establishment ceasing with immediate effect until a corrective action plan is developed, agreed by the HTA and implemented.

(3) A notice of suspension of licensable activities

(4) Additional conditions being proposed

(5) Directions being issued requiring specific action to be taken straightaway

2. Major shortfall:

A non-critical shortfall; a shortfall in the carrying out of licensable activities which poses an indirect risk to the quality and safety of an organ intended for transplantation or which poses an indirect risk to the safety of a donor or recipient

or

A shortfall in the establishment's quality and safety procedures which poses an indirect risk to the quality and safety of an organ intended for transplantation or which poses an indirect risk to the safety of a donor or recipient;

or

A shortfall which indicates a major deviation from the **Human Tissue (The Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation) Regulations 2012 (as amended)** or the **Documentary Framework for the Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation**;

or

A combination of several 'minor' shortfalls, none of which is major on its own, but which, viewed cumulatively, could constitute a major shortfall by adversely affecting quality and safety of an organ intended for transplantation or the safety of a donor or recipient;

In response to a major shortfall, an establishment is expected to implement corrective and preventative actions within 1-2 months of the issue of the final audit report. Major shortfalls pose a higher level of risk and therefore a shorter deadline is given, compared to minor shortfalls, to ensure the level of risk is reduced in an appropriate timeframe.

3. Minor shortfall:

A shortfall which cannot be classified as either critical or major and, which can be addressed by further development by the establishment.

This category of shortfall requires the development of a corrective action plan, the results of which will usually be assessed by the HTA either by desk-based review or at the time of the next audit.

In response to a minor shortfall, an establishment is expected to implement corrective and preventative actions within 3-4 months of the issue of the final audit report.

Follow up actions

A template corrective and preventative action plan will be sent as a separate Word document with the final audit report. The establishment must complete this template and return it to the HTA within 14 days of the issue of the final report.

Based on the level of the shortfall, the HTA will consider the most suitable type of follow-up of the completion of the corrective and preventative action plan. This may include a combination of:

- a follow-up site-visit audit
- a request for information that shows completion of actions
- monitoring of the action plan completion
- follow up at next routine site-visit audit

After an assessment of the proposed action plan, the establishment will be notified of the follow-up approach the HTA will take.

Appendix 3: HTA Assessment criteria

The HTA assessment criteria applicable to this establishment are shown below; those not assessed during the audit are shown in grey text. Individual standards which are not applicable to this establishment have been excluded.

Donor Characterisation and Organ Characterisation

CT1) Where a donor is deceased, a registered medical practitioner, or a person acting under the supervision of a registered medical practitioner, has endeavored to obtain information from the relatives or other persons about the donor, and has explained the importance of swift transmission of information. **(The establishment is not responsible for obtaining information relating to a deceased donor. This will be carried out by the specialist nurse – organ donation (SN-OD) under NHSBT's licence).**
CT2) Donors and organs are characterised before implantation by the collection of information specified in Annex A of The Quality and Safety of Organs

Intended for Transplantation: A documentary framework.
CT3) Donors and organs are characterised before implantation by, where considered appropriate, the collection of information specified in Annex B of The Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation: A documentary framework.
CT4) All information relating to donor and organ characterisation is kept for a period of 30 years from the date of retrieval of the organ and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.
CT5) Tests required for donor and organ characterisation are carried out by laboratories with United Kingdom Accreditation Service (UKAS) accreditation (to ISO15189:2021).
CT6) Information on organ and donor characterisation reaches the person who will be implanting an organ within a time period that would not compromise the quality and safety of the organ and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.

Retrieval of Organs for transplantation

R1) Procurement is only carried out after all the requirements relating to consent (or authorisation in Scotland) have been met.
R2) Material and equipment used in retrieval meets the requirements of The Medical Devices Regulations 2002 (SI 2002/618) (as amended) (UK MDR 2002), where these apply, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.
R3) Reusable instruments used in retrieval are subject to a validated cleaning and sterilisation procedure for removal of infectious agents, which is documented.
R4) Endeavours are made to follow-up a living donor for the purposes of identifying and managing any event potentially relating to the quality and safety of the donated organ and any serious adverse reaction in the living donor that may result from the donation

Organ preservation

P1) Material and equipment used in organ preservation meet the requirements of The Medical Devices Regulations 2002 (SI 2002/618) (as amended) (UK MDR 2002), where these apply, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.
P2) Reusable instruments used in organ preservation are subject to a validated cleaning and sterilisation procedure for removal of infectious agents, which is documented.
P3) Records of perfusion fluid coming into contact with organs are made on the appropriate HTA A and B forms.

Making arrangements to transport an organ

TP1) The integrity of the organ is maintained during transport and the transport time is suitable to ensure the quality and safety of the organ, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.
TP2) The organ shipping container is suitable for transport of the specified organ.
TP3) The organ shipping container used for transporting organs from the licensed premises is labelled with the information specified in The Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation: A documentary framework, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.
TP4) Transported organs are accompanied by a report on the organ and donor characterisation, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.
TP5) Arrangements are in place to ensure that any organisations transporting organs on behalf of the licence holder meet the requirements for transportation and serious adverse event and reaction reporting specified in the framework document.

Implantation

I1) The identification of the donor and the collection of the information in Annex A and B of The Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for transplantation: A documentary framework, are verified prior proceeding to implant an organ, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.
I2) Compliance with the conditions of preservation and transport outlined in The Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation: A documentary framework are verified prior to proceeding to implant an organ.
I3) Where any of the information specified in Annex A of The Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation: A documentary framework is not available; a risk-benefit analysis is conducted to determine whether the expected benefits for the recipient of the organ outweigh the risks posed by the lack of any information.

Traceability – (*these criteria apply to all licensed activities*)

TC1) The data required to ensure traceability of organs are recorded using the HTA A and B forms, which are returned to NHSBT within 7 days, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.
TC2) There is an identification system for donor and recipient to identify each donation and each of the organs and recipients associated with it.
TC3) A record (date and time) of the transportation of organs arriving at and/or leaving the establishment is kept for 30 years as part of the traceability information.

Serious adverse events and adverse reactions (SAEARs) – (these criteria apply to all licensed activities)

S1) Operating procedures are in place for the management of a serious adverse event or a serious adverse reaction.
S2) Serious adverse events and reactions are reported to NHSBT within 24 hours of discovery, a follow-up report is provided within 90 days, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.
S3) Third parties, such as those undertaking testing or transportation, are instructed to report any serious adverse events and reactions to the licence holder within 24 hours of discovery.

General – (*these criteria apply to all licensed activities*)

GN1) Healthcare personnel directly involved in the chain from donation to the transplantation or disposal of an organ are competent and suitably qualified or trained to perform their tasks.
GN2) Healthcare personnel directly involved in the chain from donation to the transplantation or disposal of an organ are provided with the training necessary to perform their tasks.
GN3) Medical activities are performed under the advice and guidance of a registered medical practitioner, and there are operating procedures in place to demonstrate this.