Site visit audit report on compliance with HTA requirements

Sheffield Teaching Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust

HTA licensing number 40034

Licensed for

- **Procurement Activities**: donor characterisation (DC), organ characterisation (OC), preservation of an organ (P), making arrangements to transport an organ (T), retrieval of an organ (R)

- **Transplantation Activities**: organ characterisation (OC), preservation of an organ (P), making arrangements to transport an organ (T), implantation of an organ (I)

Under the Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation Regulations 2012, as amended by the Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation (Amendment) Regulations 2014

29 January 2019

Summary of Audit findings

Sheffield Teaching Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust (the establishment) was found to have met all relevant assessment criteria.

The HTA has given advice to the establishment with respect to monitoring of fridge temperatures and documentation.
The HTA’s regulatory requirements

The HTA shall ensure that licence holders are audited for the purposes of ensuring compliance with the licensing conditions in schedule 1 of The Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation Regulations 2012 and any requirements imposed by directions made under these Regulations.

The assessment criteria reflect the requirements of the statutory conditions outlined in schedule 1 and the HTA’s directions. They are designed to promote the safe use of human organs and ensure traceability is maintained between donor and recipient. The HTA audits establishments it licences against eight groups of assessment criteria:

- Donor characterisation and organ characterisation
- Retrieval of organs for transplantation
- Organ preservation
- Making arrangements to transport an organ
- Implantation
- Traceability
- Serious adverse events and serious adverse reactions
- General (apply to all licences)

Reports of HTA audits are published on the HTA’s website.

Throughout the audit process, the HTA assesses the establishment against the assessment criteria. Where the HTA determines that an assessment criteria is not met, the level of the shortfall is classified as ‘Critical’, ‘Major’ or ‘Minor’ (see Appendix 1: Classification of the level of shortfall). Where HTA assessment criteria are fully met, but the HTA has identified an area of practice that could be further improved, advice is provided in this report.

Licensable activities carried out by the establishment – Procurement activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organ type</th>
<th>Kidney</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adult living</td>
<td>DC, OC, P, T, R</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Procurement Activities: donor characterisation (DC), organ characterisation (OC), preservation of an organ (P), making arrangements to transport an organ (T), retrieval of an organ (R)

Licensable activities carried out by the establishment – Transplant activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organ type</th>
<th>Kidney</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adult</td>
<td>OC, P, T, I</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Transplantation Activities: organ characterisation (OC), preservation of an organ (P), making arrangements to transport an organ (T), implantation of an organ (I)

Background to the establishment and description of audit activities undertaken

Sheffield Teaching Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust (the establishment) is a single organ centre (kidneys) and has been licensed by the HTA since August 2012 under the Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation Regulations 2012, as amended by the Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation (Amendment) Regulations 2014.
The establishment carries out deceased and living donor adult kidney transplants within the renal unit at Northern General Hospital. The establishment carries out approximately 72 transplants annually, of these 50 being transplants of cadaveric donor kidneys, the remainder being living donor kidney transplants. There is no paediatric service.

Tissue typing and cross-matching for the establishment are performed at a nearby location by a histocompatibility and immunogenetics (H&I) laboratory. All laboratories undertaking donor and organ characterisation assessments are appropriately accredited by a relevant body. The Trust does not participate in the National Organ Retrieval Service (NORS).

Equipment used during transplants is CE-marked and meets the requirements of the medical devices regulations. The establishment has a standard operating procedure, which mandates that all equipment that is purchased is compliant with the requirements of the medical devices regulations.

Medical activities being undertaken at the establishment are performed under the advice and guidance of a registered medical practitioner (RMP). Healthcare staff directly involved in the chain from donation to transplantation are suitably qualified and are provided with training necessary to perform their tasks.

During the audit, the auditors followed the pathway of a kidney received into the hospital for transplantation. Policies and procedures, and a sample of transplant patient clinical records were reviewed. Round-table meetings with staff involved in transplantation also took place.

**Living Donor Kidney Transplants**

Potential transplant candidates often refer themselves to the establishment in clinic.

Once a potential donor is identified, an initial assessment is completed and information is given to the recipient by the living donor co-ordinator (LDC) which is then passed on to the potential donor.

The LDC provides information to potential donors on the risks associated with living donation. The LDC in conjunction with RMPs, arrange appointments for potential donors so that the potential donors can attend clinics where donor and organ characterisation assessments can take place. All assessments are documented in the donor’s clinical notes and are discussed at a multi-disciplinary team (MDT) meeting (see Advice, item 1.)

Once all the donor characterisation assessments are completed and signed off by the nephrologist and consultant surgeon, the case will be referred to the independent assessor (IA). Tissue typing and cross matching takes place at the nearby H&I laboratory which has United Kingdom Accreditation Service (UKAS) accreditation.

The consultant surgeon checks that consent is in place before the organ retrieval surgery commences. The retrieving surgeon is responsible for reviewing the information in the donor notes prior to retrieval. Living donor transplants take place in a dedicated theatre within the hospital with the donor being brought to theatre in the morning, and the recipient brought to the theatre in the afternoon.

Perfusion fluid is stored in a fridge near the theatres that is checked daily but temperature is not recorded. Perfusion fluid stock is stored in a nearby storage room that does not have ambient room temperature recorded (see Advice, item 2).
The consultant surgeon completes the HTA-A and HTA-B forms. These forms are checked by the nursing staff and the LDC returns the forms to NHS Blood and Transplant (NHSBT) within 7 days.

Following the transplant, the donor and recipient remain in hospital for a period of time and are monitored by the consultant nephrologist regularly during this time. The establishment makes arrangements for on-going monitoring and follow up of the donor. If the donor wishes to be returned to the care of their general practitioner (GP), a discharge letter is sent to the donor’s GP (see Advice, item 3).

Deceased Donor Kidney Transplants

Offers of deceased donor kidneys are received directly by the on-call transplant surgeon who has access to the mobile NHSBT Electronic Offering System (EOS) and who makes the decision whether to accept the organ being offered. Once an offer is received and accepted, the surgeon contacts the recipient coordinator who arranges transport by the Trust’s contracted transport provider from the donor hospital to the establishment.

A service legal agreement with the transport provider details what procedures the driver must follow at the donor hospital and also when delivering the organ to the renal ward at the establishment. This procedure is supported by several checklists, which must be completed and signed by the driver and staff, recording time and date of handover and confirming the checks carried out on transport box integrity, identifications, labelling, security tag numbers and slush ice levels.

Organs are delivered direct to the renal ward and placed in a secure room. A member of staff will check the packaging and paperwork including the donor identification details. These checks are recorded using a checklist for accepting deceased donor kidneys. If the kidney is not taken to theatres immediately, staff check the ice levels every two hours and replenish when necessary which again is recorded on the checklist for accepting deceased donor kidney.

The implanting surgeon checks the donor’s blood group using the hard copy donor blood group form and reviews the HTA-A form that accompanies the organ. The surgeon cross matches these details with those of the expected donor obtained from EOS prior to the kidney being implanted.

A sample of transport fluid that surrounds kidneys is sent to the microbiology laboratory for analysis. The establishment informs ODT Hub Operations if any microorganism is detected in the transport fluid.

Audit of Clinical Notes and Document Review

During the establishment’s audit, a review of the following was undertaken by the audit team:

- Three sets of living kidney transplant recipient clinical notes and associated donor files
- Files relating to two deceased kidney transplants; and

In all of these cases, where applicable, the following records were reviewed:

- HTA-A and HTA-B forms
- Medical questionnaire
- Records of perfusion fluids/batch numbers used
- HTA approval form and referral letter
• Consent for donation
• HLA typing
• Blood test results
• Discharge letter

No anomalies were identified during the review.

The HTA audit team also reviewed the establishment’s operating procedures, surgical checklists and accreditation certificates from the relevant laboratories and sterile services department.

**Compliance with HTA assessment criteria**

All applicable assessment criteria were fully met.

**Advice**

The HTA advises the establishment to consider the following to further improve practices.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Assessment Criterion</th>
<th>Advice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>CT2</td>
<td>The establishment is advised to ensure that living donor characterisation is undertaken in accordance with British Transplantation Society or The Advisory Committee on the Safety of Blood, Tissues and Organs (SaBTO) guidelines as currently the unit does not ensure that a blood sample is tested for HIV, HBV and HCV at a maximum of 30 days prior to organ donation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>P1</td>
<td>The establishment is advised to monitor and record ambient room temperatures where perfusion fluid is stored to help assure itself that perfusion fluids have not been exposed to any deviations in temperature outside of the manufacturer’s recommended storage temperature range. In addition, this temperature monitoring should extend to the fridge near theatres that stores perfusion fluid. This may help to alert establishment staff to deviations in temperatures from the expected range during out of hours periods.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>R4</td>
<td>If the living donor is to be returned to the care of their local GP, the establishment is advised to include in the discharge letter to the GP a reminder to alert the establishment should the living donor present with any medical conditions which may have an impact the recipient. The establishment is advised to also provide information to the donor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Assessment Criterion</td>
<td>Advice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>advising them to inform their GP in case of events or reactions that they experience and which may have a potential consequence for the organ recipient.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Concluding comments**

The transplant activities are undertaken by a team of surgeons and supported by dedicated staff within the theatres, clinics and associated laboratories. During the audit, good communication and a strong working relationship between all establishment staff was observed.

The HTA has given advice to the establishment with respect to temperature monitoring and documentation.

The HTA has assessed the establishment as suitable to be licensed for the activities specified.

**Report sent for factual accuracy: 20/02/2019**

**Report returned with comments: 04/03/19**

**Final report issued: 04/03/19**
Appendix: Classification of the level of shortfall

Where the HTA determines that an assessment criterion is not met, the improvements required will be stated and the level of the shortfall will be classified as ‘Critical’, ‘Major’ or ‘Minor’. Where the HTA is not presented with evidence that an establishment meets the requirements of an assessment criterion, it works on the premise that a lack of evidence indicates a shortfall.

The action an establishment will be required to make following the identification of a shortfall is based on the HTA's assessment of risk of harm and/or a breach of the HT Act or associated Directions.

1. Critical shortfall:

A shortfall which poses a significant direct risk of causing harm to the quality of an organ intended for transplantation or which poses a significant direct risk of causing harm to a donor or recipient.

Or

A number of ‘major’ shortfalls, none of which is critical on its own, but viewed cumulatively represent a systemic failure and therefore are considered ‘critical’.

A critical shortfall may result in one or more of the following:

(1) A notice of proposal being issued to revoke the licence

(2) Some or all of the licensable activity at the establishment ceasing with immediate effect until a corrective action plan is developed, agreed by the HTA and implemented.

(3) A notice of suspension of licensable activities

(4) Additional conditions being proposed

(5) Directions being issued requiring specific action to be taken straightaway

2. Major shortfall:

A non-critical shortfall.

A shortfall in the carrying out of licensable activities which poses an indirect risk to the quality and safety of an organ intended for transplantation or which poses an indirect risk to the safety of a donor or recipient

Or

A shortfall in the establishment’s quality and safety procedures which poses an indirect risk to the quality and safety of an organ intended for transplantation or which poses an indirect risk to the safety of a donor or recipient;
A shortfall which indicates a major deviation from the Human Tissue (The Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation) Regulations 2012 or the Documentary Framework for the Quality and Safety of Organs Intended for Transplantation;

Or

A combination of several ‘minor’ shortfalls, none of which is major on its own, but which, viewed cumulatively, could constitute a major shortfall by adversely affecting quality and safety of an organ intended for transplantation or the safety of a donor or recipient;

In response to a major shortfall, an establishment is expected to implement corrective and preventative actions within 1-2 months of the issue of the final audit report. Major shortfalls pose a higher level of risk and therefore a shorter deadline is given, compared to minor shortfalls, to ensure the level of risk is reduced in an appropriate timeframe

3. Minor shortfall:

A shortfall which cannot be classified as either critical or major and, which can be addressed by further development by the establishment.

This category of shortfall requires the development of a corrective action plan, the results of which will usually be assessed by the HTA either by desk based review or at the time of the next audit.

In response to a minor shortfall, an establishment is expected to implement corrective and preventative actions within 3-4 months of the issue of the final audit report.

Follow up actions

A template corrective and preventative action plan will be sent as a separate Word document with both the draft and final audit report. You must complete this template and return it to the HTA within 14 days of the issue of the final report.

Based on the level of the shortfall, the HTA will consider the most suitable type of follow-up of the completion of the corrective and preventative action plan. This may include a combination of:

- a follow-up audit
- a request for information that shows completion of actions
- monitoring of the action plan completion
- follow up at next desk-based or site-visit audit.

After an assessment of your proposed action plan you will be notified of the follow-up approach the HTA will take.
### HTA assessment criteria

#### Donor Characterisation and Organ Characterisation

| CT1 | Where a donor is deceased, a registered medical practitioner, or a person acting under the supervision of a registered medical practitioner, has endeavored to obtain information from the relatives or other persons about the donor, and has explained the importance of swift transmission of information. |
| CT2 | Donors and organs are characterised before implantation by the collection of information specified in Part A of the Annex to the Directive. |
| CT3 | Donors and organs are characterised before implantation by, where considered appropriate, the collection of information specified in Part B of the Annex to the Directive. |
| CT4 | All information relating to donor and organ characterisation is kept for a period of 30 years from the date of retrieval of the organ and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with. |
| CT5 | Tests required for donor and organ characterisation are carried out by laboratories with CPA or UKAS accreditation. |
| CT6 | Information on organ and donor characterisation reaches the person who will be implanting an organ within a time period that would not compromise the quality and safety of the organ and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with. |

#### Retrieval of Organs for transplantation

| R1 | Procurement is only carried out after all the requirements relating to consent (or authorisation in Scotland) have been met. |
| R2 | Material and equipment used in retrieval meets the requirements of The Medical Devices Regulations 2002 (SI 2002/618), where these apply, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with. |
| R3 | Reusable instruments used in retrieval are subject to a validated cleaning and sterilisation procedure for removal of infectious agents, which is documented. |
| R4 | Endeavours are made to follow-up a living donor for the purposes of identifying and managing any event potentially relating to the quality and safety of the donated organ and any serious adverse reaction in the living donor that may result from the donation. |

#### Organ preservation

| P1 | Material and equipment used in organ preservation meet the requirements of The Medical Devices Regulations 2002 (SI 2002/618), where these apply, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with. |
| P2 | Reusable instruments used in organ preservation are subject to a validated cleaning and sterilisation procedure for removal of infectious agents, which is documented. |
| P3 | Records of perfusion fluid coming into contact with organs are made on the appropriate HTA A and B forms. |
### Making arrangements to transport an organ

**TP1)** The integrity of the organ is maintained during transport and the transport time is suitable to ensure the quality and safety of the organ, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.

**TP2)** The organ shipping container is suitable for transport of the specified organ.

**TP3)** The organ shipping container used for transporting organs from the licensed premises is labelled with the information specified in paragraph 68 of the framework document, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.

**TP4)** Transported organs are accompanied by a report on the organ and donor characterisation, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.

**TP5)** Arrangements are in place to ensure that any organisations transporting organs on behalf of the licence holder meet the requirements for transportation and serious adverse event and reaction reporting specified in the framework document.

### Implantation

**I1)** The identification of the donor and the collection of the information in Annex A and B of the Directive are verified prior to proceeding to implant an organ, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.

**I2)** Compliance with the conditions of preservation and transport outlined in the framework document are verified prior to proceeding to implant an organ.

**I3)** Where any of the information specified in Annex A of the Directive is not available; a risk-benefit analysis is conducted to determine whether the expected benefits for the recipient of the organ outweigh the risks posed by the lack of any information.

### Traceability – *(these criteria apply to all licensed activities)*

**TC1)** The data required to ensure traceability of organs are recorded using the HTA A and B forms, which are returned to NHSBT within 7 days, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.

**TC2)** There is an identification system for donor and recipient to identify each donation and each of the organs and recipients associated with it.

**TC3)** A record (date and time) of the transportation of organs arriving at and/or leaving the establishment is kept for 30 years as part of the traceability information.

### Serious adverse events and adverse reactions (SAEARs) – *(these criteria apply to all licensed activities)*

**S1)** Operating procedures are in place for the management of a serious adverse event or a serious adverse reaction.

**S2)** Serious adverse events and reactions are reported to NHSBT within 24 hours of discovery, a follow-up report is provided within 90 days, and there is an operating procedure in place to demonstrate how this requirement is complied with.

**S3)** Third parties, such as those undertaking testing or transportation, are instructed to report any serious adverse events and reactions to the licence holder within 24 hours of discovery.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General – <em>(these criteria apply to all licensed activities)</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GN1) Healthcare personnel directly involved in the chain from donation to the transplantation or disposal of an organ are competent and suitably qualified or trained to perform their tasks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GN2) Healthcare personnel directly involved in the chain from donation to the transplantation or disposal of an organ are provided with the training necessary to perform their tasks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GN3) Medical activities are performed under the advice and guidance of a registered medical practitioner, and there are operating procedures in place to demonstrate this.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>