

Minutes of the thirtieth meeting of the Human Tissue Authority

Date 15 July 2008

Venue The Law Society
113 Chancery Lane
London
WC2A 1PL

Present	
<p>Members</p> <p>Ms Shirley Harrison (Chair) Professor Michael Banner Mrs Jodi Berg Dr Kate Robson-Brown Mr Brian Coulter Dr Ceri Davies Mrs Pamela Goldberg Professor James Ironside Ms Ruth Musson Mr Keith Rigg Ms Helen Shaw Professor Sir James Underwood</p>	<p>In attendance</p> <p>Mr Adrian McNeil (Chief Executive) Mr Leslie Boodram (Director of Resources) Dr Shaun Griffin (Director of Communications) Mr Peter Lemmey (Director of Policy) Dr Sandy Mather (Director of Regulation) Ms Priya Goyal (Authority Secretary)</p> <p>Observers</p> <p>Dr Claire Bithell Ms Emma Fisher Ms Ofa Lesuma Mr Andy Thornley Ms Tess Wood</p>

(I) = for information; (D) = for decision

Item	Title	Action
Item 1	Welcome and apologies	
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Shirley Harrison welcomed the following observers from the HTA executive: Ofa Lesuma (Head of Human Resources), Andy Thornley (Communications Officer) and Tess Wood (Resources Assistant). Claire Bithell (Media Manager) and Emma Fisher (Policy Analyst) attended for the items on Directed Deceased Donation and Definition of Death. 2. Apologies had been received from Dr Andrew Reid, Ms Catharine Seddon, Ms Michaela Willis and Mr Peter Jones. 3. Shirley Harrison reported that she would need to leave early to attend the penultimate meeting of the Organ Donation Taskforce. She had changed the order of the agenda so that she could chair item 8 (Directed Deceased Donation) and item 10 (Definition of Death). James Ironside had agreed to chair the remainder of the meeting. 	
Item 2	Declaration of interests	
	4. None were declared.	
Item 3	Minutes from 17 June 2008 [paper: HTA (30/08)]	
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 5. Subject to the following change the minutes were agreed as an accurate record: 6. Paragraph 21: Andrew Reid had commented that the revised code on anatomical examination should be consistent with coroners law in terms of its guidance on storage for anatomical examination. 	PG
Item 4	Matters Arising	PL
	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 7. Paragraph 7: Peter Lemmey reported that an ad hoc group of Members had discussed the proposed text for the revised code of practice on disposal of human tissue. A draft version of the text for consultation had been agreed and this would be sent to all Members for final comment. 8. Paragraph 11: Adrian McNeil said that the business case for an increase in headcount was in preparation. There was a need for more staff than the consultants had recommended because of additional work that had arisen from the European Directives. The need for more staff would affect the business case for new accommodation, which he had agreed with DH should be put on hold until the new headcount had been agreed. Sandy Mather reaffirmed that more staff were needed in her Directorate, 	

Item	Title	Action
	<p>particularly to regulate the Human Application sector and to manage the increase in regulatory activity in the post-mortem sector. Shaun Griffin added that the structure and resourcing of the communications team would need to be rethought in the light of organisational change.</p> <p>9. Paragraph 25: Shaun Griffin said that all case studies had been checked prior to the interviews taking place and that the Annual Review would be launched at the report back meeting in September.</p> <p>10. Paragraph 33: Ceri Davies asked about the consultation arrangements for the codes revision project. Peter Lemmey said that the Authority was on target to start the consultation on 1 August. Brian Coulter requested that dates for the consultation workshops be sent to Members as soon as these had been arranged.</p>	PL
Item 5	Chair's Report (I)	
	<p>11. Shirley Harrison said that she had attended the dinner organised by the Royal College of Pathologists on 18 June.</p> <p>12. As this was the last Authority meeting before September, she reminded Members that the public meeting would be held in the morning of 18 September. This would be followed in the afternoon by the annual report back; and the Authority awayday would take place the following day on 19 September. As last year, all these meetings would be held at the Wellcome Trust and Members would receive a brief in early September setting out timings and content.</p>	SG
Item 6	Chief Executive's Report (I) [paper: HTA (31/08)]	
	<p>13. Adrian McNeil introduced the item.</p> <p>14. Objectives 3 and 14: Sandy Mather said that relatively few licence applications from procurement organisations had been received by the 5 July deadline. One reason might be that many organisations were able to undertake procurement under a third party agreement. It had been made clear that organisations that did not meet the deadline would have to suspend activity until a licence was granted.</p> <p>15. She added that, once additional staff were in place, it was more likely that the target of undertaking 123 risk-based inspections by the end of the business year would be met.</p> <p>16. Objective 8: Peter Lemmey said that members of the Executive had met key stakeholders in the research community to discuss the draft code of practice on research.</p>	

Item	Title	Action
	<p>estimate, he felt sure that these cases would arise infrequently.</p> <p>28. Jodi Berg said that the first principle about urgent clinical need seemed to be in conflict with respecting the wishes of the deceased. Keith Rigg explained that there were different allocation criteria depending on the organ and that for kidneys, fewer cases of urgent need arose.</p> <p>29. Members agreed that, in cases where a person died whilst being worked up as a living donor, the directed donation should proceed after their death: to all intents, these cases were a continuation of the living donation process. However, other situations in which individuals had put themselves forward as living donors but had subsequently been unable to donate were thought to be less clear cut.</p> <p>30. Members were clear that if there was to be a change in policy, it had to be limited to exceptional situations that did not have an adverse impact on the national allocation system. They felt that they needed more information about the possible implications of allowing such exceptions before they could consider the matter further.</p> <p>31. It was agreed that further statistical information and discussion with practitioners would be useful. Further discussion would also be held with NHSBT and DH before the issue was brought back to the Authority for final consideration.</p>	PL
Item 9	<p>Audit Committee annual report 2007/08 (I) [paper: HTA (34/08)]</p> <p>32. Michael Banner introduced the report which he said was for information.</p> <p>33. Members noted the report.</p>	
Item 10	Definition of death (I) [verbal]	
	<p>34. Peter Lemmey gave a verbal update. He reminded Members that they had expressed reservations about an early version of the draft guidance prepared by the Academy of Medical Royal Colleges (AMRC). The HTA had not yet received a further version.</p> <p>35. Michael Banner said that the AMRC guidance failed to distinguish between the medical and the ethical and social understanding of death. Helen Shaw thought it was important that the Authority considered these wider aspects in relation to the scheduled purposes in the HT Act. Keith Rigg said that the scope of the AMRC's document was limited to providing guidance on the diagnosis of brain stem</p>	

Item	Title	Action
	<p>and cardiac death.</p> <p>36. Peter Lemmey said that the policy directorate would start work to scope out how the definition of death applied to each of the scheduled purposes in the HT Act. He proposed convening an ad hoc group of Members to advise the Executive on the development of the policy.</p>	PL
<p>Item 11</p>	<p>Any other business</p>	
	<p>37. Members said they wanted to discuss succession planning and workload at the away day. It was agreed that, when completed, the business case and an organisation chart should be circulated to Members in advance of the away day.</p>	AM

The meeting closed at 1.30pm